Tumour necrosis factor and other cytokines in murine lupus

Argyrios N Theofilopoulos, Brian R Lawson

Investigations into the structure, expression and functional status of cytokines, as well as on the possible utility of their agonists and antagonists as therapeutic agents in lupus, have received prominent attention. In fact, mouse strains predisposed to lupus (NZBxW, BXSB, MRL-*lpr*) have long constituted the primary resource to investigate the role of cytokines in autoimmunity. An additional impetus for such investigations in recent years has been provided by the discovery that T cells may be polarised during an ongoing immune response into the so called T_H1 and T_H2 subsets, which display distinct cytokine profiles and effector functions. Thus, following antigen recognition, cytokines present at the site of priming together with other factors, such as type of antigen presenting cell, amount of antigen, co-stimulatory molecules, affinity and duration of exposure direct the induction of either T_H1 cells, which secrete IL2, IFN γ and TNF β , or T_H2 cells, which secrete IL4, IL5, IL6, IL10 and IL13.¹ Another cytokine, IL12, produced by activated macrophages and dendritic cells, is a strong inducer of T_H1 cells in which the β -subunit of its receptor is retained but lost on T_H2 cells. The former cells then provide protection from intracellular pathogens, activate phagocytes, induce IgG2a antibodies, and promote DTH responses, whereas the latter cells provide protection from extracellular pathogens, activate eosinophils, induce IgE mediated allergic reactions, and generally promote humoral responses in which IgG1 predominates. The molecular events associated with this polarisation have not been fully elucidated, but certain protooncogenes, kinases and transcription factors seem to play a part.^{2–6}

Based on this T cell division, it has been hypothesised that organ specific autoimmune diseases such as IDDM should be mediated by T_H1 cells, whereas humorally mediated autoimmune diseases such as lupus should be mediated by T_H2 cells. As summarised in tables 1, 2 and 3 and reviewed below, such a paradigm does not seem to apply to lupus because both T_H1 and T_H2 cytokines have been found to

exert profound effects on spontaneous mouse models of this disease.

T_H1 cytokines

The earliest cytokine defect identified in all lupus strains was reduced production of, and response to, IL2.^{7–8} This defect appears at 4–6 weeks of age in MRL-*lpr* and BXSB mice, and somewhat later in the (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice, wherein it becomes more pronounced with disease advancement. The cause(s) of this defect is unknown, but several possibilities have been considered, including impaired T cell receptor (TCR) signal transduction, IL2R structural defects, abnormalities in certain transcription factors, and exhaustion subsequent to excessive and repetitive activation *in vivo*.^{9–11} Among these possibilities, we favour that of exhaustion and attainment of a replicative senescence state. According to this hypothesis, because of continued autoantigen presence there is a repetitive interconversion of effector T cells into memory cells and vice versa. Upon a defined number of such interconversions, memory cells become refractory to further stimulation and entry into the cell cycle (fig 1). In support of this concept is the finding that the frequency of *in vivo* cycling T cells in lupus mice declines progressively with age, and this decline is associated with increased expression of cyclin dependent kinase inhibitors, a characteristic of cells that reach replicative senescence.^{12–13}

The relation of the IL2 defect to the disease process remains unclear. Several reports have shown correction of the *in vitro lpr* T cell defective proliferation and apoptosis by exogenous IL2.^{14–16} Moreover, an early study found reduced serological, cellular and histological abnormalities of the MRL-*lpr* mouse following infections with a vaccinia virus-IL2 construct.¹⁷ Similarly, in a very recent study,¹⁸ MRL-*lpr* mice infected orally by gavage with an attenuated strain of *Salmonella typhimurium* transfected with the IL2 gene (administered at 6 weeks of age and repeated every three weeks to 15 weeks of age) were shown to have reduced double negative T cells, autoantibody levels, glomerulonephritis (GN) and vasculitis. In contrast, intramuscular injections of an IL2 encoding cDNA expression vector in MRL-*lpr* mice were reported to increase autoantibody production and disease.¹⁹ Another study²⁰ reported no effect on disease progression and severity in (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice treated with low or high doses of human recombinant IL2, while others found suppression of nephritis in (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice treated with anti-IL2R mAb.²¹ The divergence of results in these stud-

Department of Immunology, The Scripps Research Institute, La Jolla, USA

Correspondence to: Professor A N Theofilopoulos, Immunology Department/IMM3, 10550 North Torrey Pines Road, La Jolla, CA 92037, USA.

Figure 1 Schematic representation of replicative senescence in repeatedly activated autoreactive memory T cells.

Table 1 *In vitro* and *in vivo* cytokine expression levels in lupus mice

Strains	IL1 β	IL2	IL4	IL6	IL10	IL12	IFN γ	TNF α	TGF β
(NZB X W) F_1	↑	↓	↓	ND	↑	↓	↑	↓	↑
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	↑	↓	↓	ND	↑	↑	↑	↑	ND
BXSB- <i>Yaa</i>	↑	↓	ND	ND	↑	?	↑	↑	↑

↑ increased expression, ↓ decreased expression, ND no difference from normal controls, ? no data exist.

ies may be attributable to differences in the vectors and lupus strains used as well as the route, timing and dose of IL2. Such differences may affect overall IL2 levels, its expression in the microenvironment of secondary lymphoid organs, and rates of T cell proliferation and apoptosis. Nevertheless, some studies have suggested dissociation of severe lupus disease and the *in vitro* IL2 deficiency.²²⁻²⁴ Overall, it seems that the role of IL2 in lupus disease has not yet been conclusively decided, and further investigation is required in view of the presence of autoimmunity in normal background mice with forced deletions of the IL2²⁵ or the IL2R^{26,27} genes.

Among the many cytokine abnormalities found in lupus mice, the most consistent has been high expression of IFN γ .²⁸⁻³⁰ The importance of this cytokine in murine lupus pathogenesis was initially suggested by the demonstration that (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice treated with IFN γ showed accelerated disease and conversely, treatment with anti-IFN γ antibody³¹ or soluble IFN γ R³² early in life significantly delayed disease progression. A study on a long lived substrain of MRL-*lpr* mice also showed reduced IFN γ levels compared with the early life severe disease developing parental strain concomitant with a shift of Ig isotypes from the C-fixing IgG2a and the cryogenic-nephritogenic IgG3 to the less pathogenic IgG1 isotype.³³ Moreover, MRL-*lpr* mice intercrossed with an IFN γ gene deleted mouse,³⁴

MRL-*lpr* mice rendered congenic for deletions in either the IFN γ ³⁵ or the IFN γ R,^{36,37} and (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice congenic for the IFN γ R deletion³⁸ all showed significant reduction in humoral and histological characteristics of the disease. In one of these studies,³⁵ three notable observations were made. Firstly, hypergammaglobulinaemia was maintained in IFN γ ^{-/-} mice with a switch from IgG2a to IgG1 predominance but, importantly, the dramatic decrease in levels of the dominant IgG2a anti-dsDNA autoantibodies was not associated with a compensatory increase in T_H2 associated IgG subclasses. This finding suggested that therapeutic interventions with the goal of reducing IFN γ levels in lupus may selectively affect certain pathogenic autoimmune responses without significantly compromising the person's capacity to respond to exogenous antigens. This is a considerable advantage over other contemplated treatments, such as those with co-stimulation blockers wherein severe and indiscriminate immune compromise may result. Secondly, remarkably, early death and GN were also prevented in IFN γ ^{+/-} *lpr* mice (50% reduction in IFN γ levels) despite the fact that autoantibody levels and kidney immune complex deposits were equal to those in the wild type MRL-*lpr* mice. This result suggests that even partial reduction of IFN γ may curtail the deleterious effects it exerts locally on the afflicted organ. A similar uncoupling of the local inflammatory response from autoantibody production and immune complex kidney deposition has also been observed in (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice deficient in the Fc γ RI and Fc γ RIII,³⁹ that is, the Fc γ R^{-/-} (NZBxNZW) F_1 mice showed similar autoantibody levels and immune complex kidney deposits to the Fc γ R^{+/-} mice, yet they exhibited prolonged survival, reduced kidney disease and proteinuria.

Table 2 *Effects of cytokine agonists and antagonists in murine lupus*

Strain	Treatment	Disease outcome	References
(NZB X W) F_1	rIL1	More severe	63
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	rIL1R	Beneficial	93
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	rIL1R antagonist	No effect	94
(NZB X W) F_1	human rIL2 high and low doses	No effect	20
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL2R mAb	Beneficial	21
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	Vaccinia virus IL2 construct	Beneficial	17
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	<i>S typhimurium</i> with IL2 gene	Beneficial	18
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	IL2 expression vector injected IM	More severe	19
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL4 mAb	Beneficial	44
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL4 mAb + Anti-IL12 mAb	No effect	44
(NZB X W) F_1	rIL6	More severe	49
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL6 mAb	Beneficial	50
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	Anti-IL6R mAb	Beneficial	51
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL10 mAb	Beneficial	54
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL10 mAb + Anti-TNF α mAb	No effect	54
(NZB X W) F_1	rIL10	More severe	54
(NZB X W) F_1	AS101 (IL10 inhibiting immunomodulator)	Beneficial	55
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	rIL12	More severe	41
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IL12 mAb	Reduced anti-DNA, no effect on GN	44
(NZB X W) F_1	rIFN γ	More severe	31
(NZB X W) F_1	Anti-IFN γ mAb	Beneficial	31
(NZB X W) F_1	sIFN γ R	Beneficial	32
(NZB X W) F_1	rTNF α low dose (2 mo)	No effect	63
(NZB X W) F_1	rTNF α low dose (4 mo)	More severe	63
(NZB X W) F_1	rTNF α intermediate dose (4 mo)	No effect	63
(NZB X W) F_1	rTNF α high dose administered early	Beneficial	58, 73, 74
(NZB X W) F_1	rTNF α high dose administered late	No effect	58, 73
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	Anti-TNF α mAb	Beneficial	75
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	Transcriptional inhibitor of TNF α	Beneficial	79
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	Anti-TGF β mAb	Beneficial	97
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	<i>S typhimurium</i> with TGF β gene	No effect	18
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	TGF- β expression vector injected IM	Beneficial	19

Table 3 Cytokine gene knockout and transgenic lupus mice

Strain	Transgene/Knockout	Outcome	References
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	IFN γ ^{-/-}	Beneficial	34, 35
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	IFN γ ^{+/-}	Beneficial	35
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	IFN γ R ^{-/-}	Beneficial	36, 37
(NZB X W) _{F1}	IFN γ R ^{-/-}	Beneficial	38
(NZW X B6- γ aa) _{F1}	Transgenic IL4	Beneficial	52
MRL- <i>lpr</i>	IL4 ^{-/-}	Beneficial	34

Thirdly, with regards to mechanisms, the major observation was severe reduction of MHC class I and class II expression by splenic macrophages in IFN γ ^{-/-} mice, but not IFN γ ^{+/-} mice, whereas reduction in MHC class II expression by tubular epithelial cells was observed in both homozygous and heterozygous IFN γ deleted mice. Thus, insufficient upregulation of MHC on antigen presenting cells, either systemically and/or locally, may be the major mechanism by which the beneficial effects of reduced IFN γ levels are mediated.

The role of IL12 in murine lupus has also been investigated. An intrinsic defect in the in vitro production of IL12 by endotoxin activated macrophages of MRL-^{+/+} and (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice has been reported.⁴⁰ Other studies, however, found that peritoneal macrophages of MRL-*lpr* mice hyperproduce IL12 after stimulation with IFN γ and/or LPS, and exhibit high concentrations of IL12 in the serum⁴¹ as well as kidney.⁴² Moreover, daily injections of recombinant IL12 led to increased serum levels of IFN γ and nitric oxide (NO) metabolites, and accelerated GN in this model.⁴¹ These findings, together with previous reports that NO synthase inhibitors can ameliorate autoimmune disease in MRL-*lpr* mice,⁴³ suggest that the high production and response to IL12 by these mice may be important in disease pathogenesis. Treatment of (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice with anti-IL12, however, was ineffective in preventing the onset or severity of GN.⁴⁴

T_H2 cytokines

The part played by the T_H2 cytokines IL6, IL4 and IL10 in murine lupus has also been the subject of intense study. Unaltered or increased levels of IL6 have been reported.⁴⁵⁻⁴⁷ Macrophage depletion in in vitro cultures of splenic cells from (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice yielded reduced IL6 levels concomitant to decreased IgG anti-DNA levels.⁴⁸ Furthermore, administration of recombinant IL6 to (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice caused accelerated GN that correlated with marked upregulation of mesangial MHC class II antigen and glomerular ICAM-1 expression.⁴⁹ Chronic administration of a rat anti-IL6 mAb had no effect on the development of GN in (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice because of the elicitation of an anti-rat response, but tolerance induced against the heterologous Ig by the concurrent administration of anti-CD4 resulted in prevention of autoantibody production, reduced proteinuria and prolonged survival.⁵⁰ Blockade of the IL6R by a neutralising mAb to IL6R was also reported to be beneficial in MRL-*lpr* mice.⁵¹

Reduced levels of IL4 have been found in MRL-*lpr* and (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice, resulting in an increased IFN γ to IL4 ratio.³⁰ Interest-

ingly, in contrast with the expected paradigm of systemic autoimmunity being causally related to T_H2 response, GN development was completely abrogated in (NZWxC57BL/6.Yaa)_{F1} mice rendered transgenic for the IL4 gene under the control of the IgH enhancer,⁵² and this protection was associated with retention of overall titres of IgG anti-DNA autoantibodies, but a severe reduction in the nephritogenic IgG3 isotype. Others, in contrast, found that transfer of IL4 (or IL12) stimulated splenocytes from 5 month old (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice into syngeneic recipients increased the production of IgG anti-dsDNA antibodies, while administration of anti-IL4 before disease onset inhibited this production.⁴⁴ Moreover, anti-IL4 treatment alone prevented GN, while anti-IL12 alone was ineffectual. It is noteworthy that combined treatment with both antibodies abrogated the beneficial effect of anti-IL4.⁴⁴ Finally, IL4 gene deletion³⁴ as well as recombinant mouse IL4R or anti-IL4 mAb treatments⁵³ led to significantly reduced lymphadenopathy and end organ disease in MRL-*lpr* mice. BXSb male mice congenic for the IL4 deletion, however, develop disease equally as severe as that seen in the wild type mice (D Kono, A N Theofilopoulos, in preparation), indicating that this cytokine is not an obligatory participant in the autoimmune process.

All lupus strains also show increased IL10 levels,²⁹ and (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice repeatedly injected (from birth) with anti-IL10 mAb showed substantially delayed onset of autoimmunity,⁵⁴ an effect apparently mediated by upregulation of endogenous TNF α , as the anti-IL10 protection was abolished when anti-TNF α was introduced along with the anti-IL10 treatment. Conversely, administration of IL10 accelerated the onset of autoimmunity in these mice, but similar injections into normal mice had no adverse effects. The important role of this cytokine in lupus has also been suggested by the reduced autoantibody levels and kidney disease in (NZBxNZW)_{F1} mice treated with an IL10 inhibiting immunomodulator (AS101),⁵⁵ as well as by increased Ig and autoantibody production in IL10 treated cultured peripheral blood lymphocytes (PBL) from systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE) patients, and inhibition of these manifestations in anti-IL10 treated SCID mice transplanted with PBL from such patients.⁵⁶ The inference has been made that IL10 promotes systemic autoimmunity by increasing Fas/FasL mediated apoptosis.⁵⁷

Other cytokines

Additional cytokines have been implicated in lupus pathogenesis, including TNF α , IL1 and TGF β . TNF α , (a product of macrophages, T_H1 and T_H2 cells as well as B cells) exerts wide ranging effects on immune responses and inflammation and, therefore, its role in autoimmunity has been extensively investigated. It was initially shown by Jacob and McDevitt⁵⁸ that LPS activated macrophages of NZW mice produce 5-fold to 10-fold lower levels of TNF α than activated macrophages from non-autoimmune strains, and this low production was associated with a unique BamHI RFLP in

the NZW TNF α gene. Studies by these and other investigators, however, showed that the same RFLP defined allele was present in MRL and BXSB lupus strains as well as several normal strains and wild mice that produced intermediate to high levels of TNF α .^{58,59} More recent studies by Jacob and associates⁶⁰ identified diverse mutations in the 5' and 3' untranslated region (UTR) of the TNF α gene in several strains of mice. Among them, a three base pair insertion disrupting the AU rich motif of the 3'UTR was detectable in TNF α low producing NZW, B10.KPA44, SM/J strains, and in *Mus spretus*. Transient expression experiments in a macrophage cell line using the luciferase reporter system indicated that presence of the NZW 3'-UTR, indeed, leads to reduced TNF α production.⁶¹

Obviously low TNF α production is not required nor sufficient for induction of lupus. This is the case even in the New Zealand mice, as documented by the presence of delayed but still severe disease in (NZBxNZW.PL)_{F₁} mice in which the TNF α haplotype is d/d—that is, without the NZW low TNF α defect.⁶² Moreover, expression of TNF α is increased in the diseased kidneys of (NZBxNZW)_{F₁}^{63,64} as well as MRL-*lpr* mice.^{65,66} In the latter strain, a biphasic increase in circulating TNF α was recorded with an initial peak in neonatal mice 703±208 pg/ml followed by normalised levels by 2 months of age 87±13 pg/ml and progressive increases thereafter that were proportional to the severity of renal disease (non-proteinuric, 570±87; proteinuric, 1255±135 pg/ml).⁶⁷ While early in life TNF α was detected only in tubular epithelial cells (TEC), in adult MRL-*lpr* mice expression was more ubiquitous and was detected in glomeruli, perivascular infiltrating cells as well as TEC.⁶⁷ Although these findings firmly establish the high in vivo TNF α levels in MRL-*lpr* mice, it should be noted that Beller and associates^{40,68} observed defective in vitro induction of TNF α in LPS activated macrophages of the congenic non-Fas defective, mild disease manifesting MRL-+/+ mouse. This defect was noted in other lupus strains as well, and was thought to be the basis for defects in in vitro induction of other cytokines, such as IL1 and IL6. Notwithstanding these in vitro findings, the relevance of which is unclear, the fact remains that, in contrast with the NZW and (NZBxNZW)_{F₁} mice, other lupus strains are characterised by increased TNF α levels. Several studies have also shown that human lupus is characterised by high serum levels of TNF α and soluble TNFR that parallel disease activity.⁶⁹⁻⁷²

Regardless of variances in TNF α levels, the initial finding of low TNF α production by macrophages of NZW mice prompted Jacob and associates to assess its possible therapeutic effects in the (NZBxNZW)_{F₁} mouse.^{58,73} They found that TNF α replacement therapy at relatively high doses (10 µg/3 × weekly) started up to 4 months of age effectively delayed disease, but was ineffective when started at 6.5 months of age (near the 50% mortality range for these mice). Gordon *et al.*,⁷⁴ using a similar injection and dose schedule, also reported that TNF α

treatment started after the onset of clinical disease led to improved survival relative to controls (92% survival rate in treated versus 42% of control at 10 months of age). They further indicated that while administration of TNF α delayed disease progression, sustained treatment did not prevent the eventual development of severe renal disease. As noted earlier, an additional finding by Ishida *et al.*⁷⁵ was that sustained anti-IL10 treatment of (NZBxNZW)_{F₁} mice was beneficial, and that this effect was mediated by the concurrent TNF α upregulation, as simultaneous administration of anti-TNF α antibody abolished the anti-IL10 antibody effect. Overall, the above findings indicated clearly that TNF α replacement therapy is beneficial to the (NZBxW)_{F₁} mouse.

Additional findings, however, have indicated that the picture is much more complicated than was originally thought. Thus, Kelly and associates,⁶³ prompted by their finding of increased TNF α expression in the diseased kidneys of the (NZBxW)_{F₁} mouse, revisited the issue of TNF α therapy for lupus and reported that (NZBxNZW)_{F₁} female mice treated from 4 months of age with a low dose of recombinant TNF α (0.2 µg/3 × weekly) exhibited accelerated disease, while those receiving an intermediate dose (2 µg/3 × weekly) showed minor or no acceleration. Yet when the low dose treatment was started at 2 months and continued up to 4 months of age, there was no acceleration of renal disease. This latter finding was interpreted to indicate that for TNF α to cause renal injury, it must interact with other pathological features in these animals that appear after 4 months of age. Additional findings have provided further support for the notion that TNF α may, under certain circumstances, exert detrimental effects in lupus. Firstly, treatment of MRL-*lpr* mice with an IgG anti-TNF α antibody was reported to prevent development of pulmonary inflammatory lesions such as lung fibrosis and alveolitis.⁷⁵ Secondly, mice rendered defective for the *zfp36* gene, which encodes tristetraprolin, develop systemic autoimmunity apparently mediated by an attendant upregulation of TNF α , as antibodies to TNF α abrogated this syndrome⁷⁶; tristetraprolin was recently shown to be a component of a negative feedback loop that interferes with TNF α production by destabilising its mRNA.⁷⁷ Thirdly, treatment with soluble, dimeric TNFR led to reduction of disease in systemic autoimmunity manifesting motheaten mice,⁷⁸ and treatment with a novel transcriptional inhibitor of TNF α reduced superantigen induced inflammatory arthritis in MRL-*lpr* mice.⁷⁹

How can one reconcile the apparent dichotomous results reviewed above in which some studies reported beneficial and others detrimental effects of TNF α in murine lupus? On one hand, it could be argued that low doses of TNF α or short duration of treatment may promote autorecognition by, for example, upregulating MHC^{80,81} or by increasing membrane expression of autoantigens.⁸² In contrast, high doses or chronic exposure to TNF α may

inhibit autoimmunity by a variety of specific and non-specific immunosuppressive effects. With regard to non-specific immunosuppressive effects, studies by Gordon and Wofsy⁸³ have shown that mice treated with high doses of TNF α exhibit severe lymphopenia, while, with regard to specific effects studies by Cope *et al.*^{84, 85} in TCR transgenic animals showed that prolonged exposure to TNF α caused severe suppression in a broad range of T cell responses, including proliferation and cytokine production. The possible relevance of this immunosuppression has been suggested by the finding that a small, but significant, percentage (6–7%) of RA patients treated with anti-TNF α mAb developed anti-dsDNA autoantibodies.⁸⁶ Diverse effects of TNF α are obviously not confined to lupus, but seem to apply to other autoimmune disorders. Thus, TNF α treatment has been shown to inhibit or promote diabetes in NOD mice depending on the time of treatment initiation,⁸¹ while anti-TNF α mAb treatment⁸¹ as well as high transgenic expression of soluble TNFRp55-FcIgG3 fusion molecules^{87, 88} have been shown to avert disease. Apparently, because of reported beneficial and detrimental effects of TNF α in autoimmunity, terms such as “Trojan horse”⁸⁹ and “pretty girl or old witch”⁹⁰ have been coined to illustrate the unpredictable effects of this molecule.

Increased IL1 levels have been described for all lupus strains.^{91, 92} Recombinant IL1 given to (NZB $\times$ NZW)F₁ mice increased nephritis,⁶³ while recombinant IL1R given to MRL-*lpr* mice inhibited GN, splenomegaly/lymphadenopathy and autoantibody levels in one study,⁹³ while in another study, an IL1R antagonist had no effect.⁹⁴ Surprisingly, *in vitro* experiments showed that IL1 and IL1R antagonists both induced significant suppression in IgG production by B cells derived from diseased MRL-*lpr* mice, but they had no effect on B cells from young animals.^{92, 95, 96}

Male BXSB and MRL-*lpr* mice show increased levels of TGF β ,²⁹ which was shown in MRL-*lpr* mice to adversely affect host defence against both Gram negative and positive bacterial infections because of the failure of initial polymorphonuclear leucocyte migration to the infection site.^{97, 98} The role of increased TGF β levels in this defect was directly demonstrated by the fact that this abnormality was duplicated in MRL-+/+ mice injected with TGF β at the time of bacterial infection, and lethality of infected MRL-*lpr* mice was ameliorated by administration of anti-TGF β mAb.⁹⁷ Such findings suggest that increased TGF β production in lupus may suppress host defence mechanisms against bacterial infection, thereby providing an explanation for the increased risk of such infections in SLE patients. Nevertheless, direct injections into the skeletal muscle of a TGF β cDNA expression vector was reported to reduce autoantibody levels in MRL-*lpr* mice,¹⁹ while infection with a non-pathogenic strain of *Salmonella typhimurium* carrying the TGF β gene was without effect.¹⁸

Conclusions

The summarised findings on the role of cytokines in murine lupus cast doubt on the widely held view that T_H2 cytokines play the primary part in this humorally mediated autoimmune disease. It would appear that both T_H1 and T_H2 cytokines are involved, and that agonists and antagonists can disturb these cross talking classes of cytokines to exert disease inhibiting or promoting effects without any dogmatic predictability and in a far more complex manner than the simple T_H1 versus T_H2 dualism dictates. It is also evident that the effects of a given cytokine agonist or antagonist in the lupus models frequently differ from one study to another. These differences can be accounted for on the basis of variables in study design, including administration, dose, and timing of treatment initiation. Therefore, caution should be exercised in generalisations derived from one or another experiment wherein beneficial or detrimental effects are observed. Obviously, further work is needed before we fully comprehend the complex interplay between these molecules and confidently design cytokine treatments for human lupus.

This is Publication No 12324-IMM from the Department of Immunology, The Scripps Research Institute, La Jolla, California. The work of the authors herein was supported, in part, by NIH grants AR31203, AR39555 and AG15061.

- 1 Abbas AK, Murphy KM, Sher A. Functional diversity of helper T lymphocytes. *Nature* 1996;383:787–93.
- 2 Rincon M, Flavell RA. T-cell subsets: transcriptional control in the Th1/Th2 decision. *Curr Biol* 1997;7:R729–32.
- 3 Zheng W, Flavell RA. The transcription factor GATA-3 is necessary and sufficient for Th2 cytokine gene expression in CD4 T cells. *Cell* 1997;89:587–96.
- 4 Chow CW, Rincon M, Davis RJ. Requirement for transcription factor NFAT in interleukin-2 expression. *Mol Cell Biol* 1999;19:2300–7.
- 5 Rincon M, Enslen H, Raingeaud J, *et al.* Interferon-gamma expression by Th1 effector T cells mediated by the p38 MAP kinase signaling pathway. *EMBO J* 1998;17:2817–29.
- 6 Ho IC, Lo D, Glimcher LH. c-maf promotes T helper cell type 2 (Th2) and attenuates Th1 differentiation by both interleukin 4-dependent and -independent mechanisms. *J Exp Med* 1998;188:1859–66.
- 7 Altman A, Theofilopoulos AN, Weiner R, Katz DH, Dixon FJ. Analysis of T cell function in autoimmune murine strains. Defects in production of, and responsiveness to, interleukin 2. *J Exp Med* 1981;154:791–808.
- 8 Dauphinee MS, Kipper SB, Wofsy D, Talal N. Interleukin 2 deficiency is a common feature of autoimmune mice. *J Immunol* 1981;127:2483–7.
- 9 Tanaka T, Nagasaka Y, Kitamura F, Kuida K, Suwa H, Miyasaka M. The role of the interleukin-2 (IL-2)/IL-2 receptor pathway in MRL/lpr lymphadenopathy: The expanded CD4⁺ T cell subset completely lacks functional IL-2 receptors. *Eur J Immunol* 1993;23:1378–80.
- 10 Clements JL, Cooper SM, Budd RC. Abnormal regulation of the IL-2 promoter in lpr CD4⁺CD8⁺ T lymphocytes results in constitutive expression of a novel nuclear factor of activated T cells-binding factor. *J Immunol* 1995;154:6372–81.
- 11 Liang HE, Hsueh YP, Wu CC, Han SH, Lai MZ. Atypical signaling defects prevent IL-2 gene expression in *lpr/lpr* CD4⁺CD8⁺ cells. *J Biomed Sci* 1998;5:297–304.
- 12 Balomenos D, Rumold R, Theofilopoulos AN. The proliferative *in vivo* activities of *lpr* double-negative T cells and the primary role of p59^{lyn} in their activation and expansion. *J Immunol* 1997;159:2265–73.
- 13 Sabzevari H, Propp S, Kono DH, Theofilopoulos AN. G1 arrest and high expression of cyclin kinase and apoptosis inhibitors in accumulated activated/memory phenotype CD4⁺ cells of older lupus mice. *Eur J Immunol* 1997;27:1901–10.
- 14 Clements JL, Wolfe J, Cooper SM, Budd RC. Reversal of hyporesponsiveness in *lpr* CD4⁺CD8⁺ T cells is achieved by induction of cell cycling and normalization of CD2 and p59^{lyn} expression. *Eur J Immunol* 1994;24:558–65.
- 15 Huang FP, Stott DI. Restoration of an early, progressive defect in responsiveness to T-cell activation in lupus mice by exogenous IL-2. *Autoimmunity* 1993;15:19–29.
- 16 Radvanyi LG, Raju K, Spaner D, Mills GB, Miller RG. Interleukin-2 reverses the defect in activation-induced apoptosis in T cells from autoimmune *lpr* mice. *Cellular Immunol* 1998;183:1–12.

- 17 Gutierrez-Ramos JC, Andreu JL, Revilla Y, Vinuela E, Martinez C. Recovery from autoimmunity of MRL/lpr after infection with an interleukin-2/vaccinia recombinant virus. *Nature* 1990;346:271-4.
- 18 Huggins ML, Huang F-P, Xu D, Lindop G, Stott DI. Modulation of autoimmune disease in the MRL-lpr/lpr mouse by IL-2 and TGF- β 1 gene therapy using attenuated *Salmonella typhimurium* as gene carrier. *Lupus* 1999;8:29-38.
- 19 Raz E, Dudler J, Lotz M, et al. Modulation of disease activity in murine systemic lupus erythematosus by cytokine gene delivery. *Lupus* 1995;4:286-92.
- 20 Owen KL, Shibata T, Izui S, Walker SE. Recombinant interleukin-2 therapy of systemic lupus erythematosus in the New Zealand black/New Zealand white mouse. *J Biol Response Mod* 1989;8:366-74.
- 21 Kelley VE, Gaulton GN, Hattori M, Ikegami H, Eisenbarth G, Strom TB. Anti-interleukin 2 receptor antibody suppresses murine diabetic insulinitis and lupus nephritis. *J Immunol* 1988;140:59-68.
- 22 Bocchieri MH, Knittweis L, Seaton DA. Cytokine production by NZB, C58 and NZBxC58 recombinant inbred mice. *Cell Immunol* 1984;88:453-63.
- 23 Davidson WF, Roths JB, Holmes KL, Rudikoff E, Morse HE III. Dissociation of severe lupus-like disease from polyclonal B cell activation and IL2 deficiency in C3H-lpr/lpr mice. *J Immunol* 1984;133:1048-56.
- 24 Abe C, Koyama A, Nishimura T. Interleukin-2 induction, response and therapy on murine lupus lesions in the MRL/l strain. *Prog Clin Biol Res* 1987;229:147-56.
- 25 Sadlack B, Lohler J, Schorle H, et al. Generalized autoimmune disease in interleukin-2-deficient mice is triggered by an uncontrolled activation and proliferation of CD4⁺ T cells. *Eur J Immunol* 1995;25:3053-9.
- 26 Suzuki H, Kundig TM, Furlonger C, et al. Deregulated T cell activation and autoimmunity in mice lacking interleukin-2 receptor β . *Science* 1995;268:1472-6.
- 27 Willerford DM, Chen J, Ferry JA, Davidson L, Ma A, Alt F. Interleukin-2 receptor α chain regulates the size and content of the peripheral lymphoid compartment. *Immunity* 1995;3:521-30.
- 28 Davidson WF, Calkins C, Hugins A, Giese T, Holmes KL. Cytokine secretion by C3H-lpr and -gld T cells. Hypersecretion of IFN- γ and tumor necrosis factor- α by stimulated CD4⁺ T cells. *J Immunol* 1991;146:4138-48.
- 29 Prud'homme GJ, Kono DH, Theofilopoulos AN. Quantitative polymerase chain reaction analysis reveals marked overexpression of interleukin-1 β , interleukin-10, and interferon- γ mRNA in the lymph nodes of lupus-prone mice. *Mol Immunol* 1995;32:495-503.
- 30 Shirai A, Conover J, Klinman DM. Increased activation and altered ratio of interferon- γ : Interleukin-4-secreting cells in MRL-lpr/lpr mice. *Autoimmunity* 1995;21:107-16.
- 31 Jacob CO, van der Meide PH, McDevitt HO. *In vivo* treatment of (NZBxNZW)F1 lupus-like nephritis with monoclonal antibody to gamma interferon. *J Exp Med* 1987;166:798-803.
- 32 Ozmen L, Roman D, Fountoulakis M, Schmid G, Ryffel B, Garotta G. Experimental therapy of systemic lupus erythematosus: The treatment of NZB/W mice with mouse soluble interferon- γ receptor inhibits the onset of glomerulonephritis. *Eur J Immunol* 1995;25:6-12.
- 33 Takahashi S, Fossati L, Iwamoto M, et al. Imbalance towards Th1 predominance is associated with acceleration of lupus-like autoimmune syndrome in MRL mice. *J Clin Invest* 1996;97:1597-604.
- 34 Peng SL, Moslehi J, Craft J. Roles of interferon- γ and interleukin-4 in murine lupus. *J Clin Invest* 1997;99:1936-46.
- 35 Balomenos D, Rumold R, Theofilopoulos AN. Interferon- γ is required for lupus-like disease and lymphoaccumulation in MRL-lpr mice. *J Clin Invest* 1998;101:364-71.
- 36 Haas C, Ryffel B, LeHir M. IFN- γ is essential for the development of autoimmune glomerulonephritis in MRL/lpr mice. *J Immunol* 1997;158:5484-91.
- 37 Schwarting A, Wada T, Kinoshita K, Tesch G, Rubin Kelley V. IFN- γ receptor signaling is essential for the initiation, acceleration, and destruction of autoimmune kidney disease in MRL-Fas^{sp} mice. *J Immunol* 1998;161:494-503.
- 38 Haas C, Ryffel B, LeHir M. IFN- γ receptor deletion prevents autoantibody production and glomerulonephritis in lupus-prone (NZBxNZW)F1 mice. *J Immunol* 1998;160:3713-18.
- 39 Clynes R, Dumitru C, Ravetch JV. Uncoupling of immune complex formation and kidney damage in autoimmune glomerulonephritis. *Science* 1998;279:1052-4.
- 40 Alleva DG, Kaser SB, Beller, D.I. Intrinsic defects in macrophage IL-12 production associated with immune dysfunction in the MRL/++ and New Zealand Black/White F1 lupus-prone mice and the Leishmania major-susceptible BALB/c strain. *J Immunol* 1998;161:6878-84.
- 41 Huang F-P, Feng G-J, Lindop G, Stott DI, Liew FY. The role of interleukin 12 and nitric oxide in the development of spontaneous autoimmune disease in MRL/MP-lpr/lpr mice. *J Exp Med* 1996;183:1447-59.
- 42 Fan X, Oertli B, Wuthrich RP. Up-regulation of tubular epithelial interleukin-12 in autoimmune MRL-Fas (lpr) mice with renal injury. *Kidney Int* 1997;51:79-86.
- 43 Weinberg JB, Granger DL, Pisetsky DS, et al. The role of nitric oxide in the pathogenesis of spontaneous murine autoimmune disease: increased nitric oxide production and nitric oxide synthase expression in MRL-lpr/lpr mice, and reduction of spontaneous glomerulonephritis and arthritis by orally administered NG-monomethyl-L-arginine. *J Exp Med* 1994;179:651-60.
- 44 Nakajima A, Hirose S, Yagita H, Okumura K. Roles of IL-4 and IL-12 in the development of lupus in NZB/W F1 mice. *J Immunol* 1997;158:1466-72.
- 45 McMurray RW, Hoffman RW, Nelson W, Walker SE. Cytokine mRNA expression in the B/W mouse model of systemic lupus erythematosus -- analyses of strain, gender, and age effects. *Clin Immunol Immunopathol* 1997;84:260-8.
- 46 Chen SY, Takeoka Y, Pike-Nobile L, Ansari AA, Boyd R, Gershwin ME. Autoantibody production and cytokine profiles of MHC class I (β 2-microglobulin) gene-deleted New Zealand Black (NZB) mice. *Clin Immunol Immunopathol* 1997;84:318-27.
- 47 Ohteki T, Okamoto S, Nakamura M, Nemoto E, Kumagai K. Elevated production of interleukin 6 by hepatic MNC correlates with ICAM-1 expression on the hepatic sinusoidal endothelial cells in autoimmune MRL/lpr mice. *Immunol Lett* 1993;36:145-52.
- 48 Alarcon-Riquelme ME, Moller G, Fernandez C. Macrophage deletion decreases IgG anti-DNA in cultures from (NZBxNZW)F1 spleen cells by eliminating the main source of IL-6. *Clin Exp Immunol* 1993;91:220-5.
- 49 Ryffel B, Car BD, Gunn H, Roman D, Hiestand P, Mihatsch MJ. Interleukin-6 exacerbates glomerulonephritis in (NZBxNZW)F1 mice. *Am J Pathol* 1994;144:927-7.
- 50 Finck BK, Chan B, Wofsy D. Interleukin 6 promotes murine lupus in NZB/NZW F1 mice. *J Clin Invest* 1994;94:585-91.
- 51 Kiberd BA. Interleukin-6 receptor blockage ameliorates murine lupus nephritis. *J Am Soc Nephrol* 1993;4:58-61.
- 52 Santiago M-L, Fossati L, Jacquet C, Muller W, Izui S, Reininger L. Interleukin-4 protects against a genetically linked lupus-like autoimmune syndrome. *J Exp Med* 1997;185:65-70.
- 53 Schorlemmer HU, Dickneite G, Kanzy EJ, Enssle KH. Modulation of the immunoglobulin dysregulation in GvH- and SLE-like diseases by the murine IL-4 receptor (IL-4-R). *Inflamm Res* 1995;44:S1946.
- 54 Ishida H, Muchamuel T, Sakaguchi S, Andrade S, Menon S, Howard M. Continuous administration of anti-interleukin 10 antibodies delays onset of autoimmunity in NZB/W F1 mice. *J Exp Med* 1994;179:305-10.
- 55 Kalechman Y, Gafter U, Da JB, Albeck M, Alarcon-Segovia D, Sredni B. Delay in the onset of systemic lupus erythematosus following treatment with the immunomodulator AS101: Association with IL-10 inhibition and increase in TNF- α levels. *J Immunol* 1997;159:2658-67.
- 56 Llorente L, Zou W, Levy Y, et al. Role of interleukin 10 in the B lymphocyte hyperactivity and autoantibody production of human systemic lupus erythematosus. *J Exp Med* 1995;181:839-44.
- 57 Georgescu L, Vakkalanka RK, Elkon KB, Crow MI. Interleukin-10 promotes activation-induced cell death of SLE lymphocytes mediated by Fas ligand. *J Clin Invest* 1997;100:2622-33.
- 58 Jacob CO, McDevitt HO. Tumor necrosis factor alpha in murine autoimmune "lupus" nephritis. *Nature (Lond)* 1988;331:356-8.
- 59 Richter G, Qin ZH, Diamantstein T, Blankenstein T. Analysis of restriction fragment length polymorphism in lymphokine genes of normal and autoimmune mice. *J Exp Med* 1989;170:1439-43.
- 60 Jacob CO, Tashman NB. Disruption in the AU motif of the mouse TNF- α 3' UTR correlates with reduced TNF production by macrophages in vitro. *Nucleic Acids Res* 1993;21:2761-6.
- 61 Jacob CO, Lee SK, Strassman G. Mutational analysis of TNF α gene reveals a regulatory role for the 3'-untranslated region in the genetic predisposition to lupus-like autoimmune disease. *J Immunol* 1996;156:3043-50.
- 62 Fujimura T, Hirose S, Jiang Y, et al. Dissection of the effects of tumor necrosis factor- α and class II gene polymorphisms within the MHC on murine systemic lupus erythematosus (SLE). *Int Immunol* 1998;10:1467-72.
- 63 Brennan DC, Yui MA, Wuthrich RP, Kelley VE. Tumor necrosis factor and IL-1 in New Zealand Black/White mice. Enhanced gene expression and acceleration of renal injury. *J Immunol* 1989;143:3470-5.
- 64 Nakamura T, Ebihara I, Fukui M, et al. Renal expression of mRNAs for endothelin-1, endothelin-3 and endothelin receptors in NZB/W F1 mice. *Ren Physiol Biochem* 1993;16:233-43.
- 65 Boswell JM, Yui MA, Burt DW, Kelley VE. Increased tumor necrosis factor and IL-1 beta gene expression in the kidneys of mice with lupus nephritis. *J Immunol* 1988;141:3050-4.
- 66 Moore KJ, Yeh K, Naito T, Kelley VR. TNF- α enhances colony-stimulating factor-1-induced macrophage accumulation in autoimmune renal disease. *J Immunol* 1996;157:427-32.
- 67 Yokoyama H, Kreft B, Kelley VR. Biphasic increase in circulating and renal TNF- α in MRL-lpr mice with differing regulatory mechanisms. *Kidney Int* 1995;47:122-30.
- 68 Alleva DG, Kaser SB, Beller DI. Aberrant cytokine expression and autocrine regulation characterize macrophages from young MRL-++ and NZB/W F1 lupus-prone mice. *J Immunol* 1997;159:5610-19.
- 69 Meijer C, Huysen V, Smeenk RT, Swaak AJ. Profiles of cytokines (TNF alpha and IL-6) and acute phase proteins

- (CRP and alpha 1AG) related to the disease course in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus. *Lupus* 1993;2: 359–65.
- 70 Aderka D, Wytensbeek A, Engelmann H, *et al.* Correlation between serum levels of soluble tumor necrosis factor receptor and disease activity in systemic lupus erythematosus. *Arthritis Rheum* 1993;36:1111–20.
 - 71 Studnicka-Benke A, Steiner G, Petera P, Smolen JS. Tumour necrosis factor alpha and its soluble receptors parallel clinical disease and autoimmune activity in systemic lupus erythematosus. *Br J Rheumatol* 1996;35:1067–74.
 - 72 Malide D, Russo P, Bendayan M. Presence of tumor necrosis factor alpha and interleukin-6 in renal mesangial cells of lupus nephritis patients. *Hum Pathol* 1995;26:558–64.
 - 73 Jacob CO, Hwang F, Lewis GD, Stall AM. Tumor necrosis factor alpha in murine systemic lupus erythematosus disease models: Implications for genetic predisposition and immune regulation. *Cytokine* 1991;3:551–61.
 - 74 Gordon C, Ranges GE, Greenspan JS, Wofsy D. Chronic therapy with recombinant tumor necrosis factor-alpha in autoimmune NZB/NZW F₁ mice. *Clin Immunol Immunopathol* 1989;52:421–34.
 - 75 Deguchi Y, Kishimoto S. Tumour necrosis factor/cachectin plays a key role in autoimmune pulmonary inflammation in lupus-prone mice. *Clin Exp Immunol* 1991;85:392–5.
 - 76 Taylor GA, Carballo E, Lee DM, *et al.* A pathogenetic role for TNF α in the syndrome of cachexia, arthritis and autoimmunity resulting from tristetraprolin (TTP) deficiency. *Immunity* 1996;4:445–54.
 - 77 Carballo E, Lai WS, Blackshear PJ. Feedback inhibition of macrophage tumor necrosis factor-alpha production by tristetraprolin. *Science* 1998;281:1001–5.
 - 78 Su X, Zhou T, Yang P, Edwards CK 3rd, Mountz JD. Reduction of arthritis and pneumonitis in motheaten mice by soluble tumor necrosis factor receptor. *Arthritis Rheum* 1998;41:139–49.
 - 79 Edwards CK III, Zhou T, Zhang J, *et al.* Inhibition of superantigen-induced proinflammatory cytokine production and inflammatory arthritis in MRL-*lpr/lpr* mice by a transcriptional inhibitor of TNF- α . *J Immunol* 1996;157: 1758–72.
 - 80 Watanabe Y, Jacob CO. Regulation of MHC class II antigen expression. Opposing effects of tumor necrosis factor-alpha on IFN-gamma-induced HLA-DR and Ia expression depends on the maturation and differentiation stage of the cell. *J Immunol* 1991;146:899–905.
 - 81 Yang XD, Tisch R, Singer SM, *et al.* Effect of tumor necrosis factor alpha on insulin-dependent diabetes mellitus in NOD mice. I. The early development of autoimmunity and the diabetogenic process. *J Exp Med* 1994;180:995–1004.
 - 82 Dorner T, Hucko M, Mayet WJ, Trefzer U, Burmester GR, Hiepe F. Enhanced membrane expression of the 52 kDa Ro(SS-A) and La(SS-B) antigens by human keratinocytes induced by TNF alpha. *Ann Rheum Dis* 1995;54:904–9.
 - 83 Gordon C, Wofsy D. Effects of recombinant murine tumor necrosis factor alpha on immune function. *J Immunol* 1996;144:1753–8.
 - 84 Cope AP, Liblau RS, Yang XD, *et al.* Chronic tumor necrosis factor alters T cell responses by attenuating T cell receptor signaling. *J Exp Med* 1997;185:1573–84.
 - 85 Cope AP. Regulation of autoimmunity by proinflammatory cytokines. *Curr Opin Immunol* 1998;10:669–76.
 - 86 Feldmann M, Brennan FM, Maini RN. Role of cytokines in rheumatoid arthritis. *Ann Rev Immunol* 1996;14:397–440.
 - 87 Hunger RE, Carnaud C, Garcia I, Vassalli P, Mueller C. Prevention of autoimmune diabetes mellitus in NOD mice by transgenic expression of soluble tumor necrosis factor receptor p55. *Eur J Immunol* 1997;27:255–61.
 - 88 Hunger RE, Muller S, Laissue JA, *et al.* Inhibition of submandibular and lacrimal gland infiltration in nonobese diabetic mice by transgenic expression of soluble TNF-receptor p55. *J Clin Invest* 1996;98:954–61.
 - 89 Hill CM, Lunee J. The TNF-ligand and receptor superfamilies: Controllers of immunity and the Trojan horses of autoimmune disease? *Mol Aspects Med* 1996;17: 455–509.
 - 90 Jacob CO. Tumor necrosis factor in autoimmunity: Pretty girl or old witch? *Immunol Today* 1992;13:122–5.
 - 91 Mao C, Singh AK. IL-1 beta gene expression in B cells derived from the murine MRL-*lpr* model of lupus. *Autoimmunity* 1996;24:71–9.
 - 92 Lebedeva TV, Singh AK. Increased responsiveness of B cells in the murine MRL-*lpr* model of lupus nephritis to interleukin-1 beta. *J Am Soc Nephrol* 1995;5:1530–4.
 - 93 Schorlemmer HU, Kanzy EJ, Langner KD, Kurrie R. Immunoregulation of SLE-like disease by the IL-1 receptor: Disease modifying activity on BDF₁ hybrid mice and MRL autoimmune mice. *Agents Actions* 1993;39: C117–20.
 - 94 Kiberd BA, Stadnyk AW. Established murine lupus nephritis does not respond to exogenous interleukin-1 receptor antagonist: A role for the endogenous molecule? *Immunopharmacology* 1995;30:131–7.
 - 95 Singh AK, Lebedeva TV. Interleukin-1 contributes to high level IgG production in the murine MRL-*lpr* lupus model. *Immunol Invest* 1994;23:281–92.
 - 96 Singh AK, Mao C, Lebedeva TV. *In vitro* role of IL-1 in heightened IgG, anti-DNA, and nephritogenic idiotype production by B cells derived from the murine MRL-*lpr* lupus model. *Clin Immunol Immunopathol* 1994;72:410–15.
 - 97 Lowrance JH, O'Sullivan FX, Caver TE, Waegell W, Gresham HD. Spontaneous elaboration of transforming growth factor beta suppresses host defense against bacterial infection in autoimmune MRL-*lpr* mice. *J Exp Med* 1994; 180:1693–703.
 - 98 Caver TE, O'Sullivan FX, Gold LJ, Gresham HD. Intracellular demonstration of active TGF β 1 in B cells and plasma cells of autoimmune mice. IgG-bound TGF β 1 suppresses neutrophil function and host defense against *Staphylococcus aureus* infection. *J Clin Invest* 1996;98:2496–506.