Determination of cytokines in synovial fluids: correlation with diagnosis and histomorphological characteristics of synovial tissue

P Kahle, J G Saal, K Schaudt, J Zacher, P Fritz, G Pawelec

Abstract
In a study aimed at correlating cytokine levels in synovial fluid with the pathology of rheumatoid arthritis (RA), tumour necrosis factor α, interleukin 1β and interferon γ were immunologically assayed in 27 patients with RA, 16 patients with other arthritides, 23 with osteoarthritis, 13 patients with trauma, and 18 patients at necropsy without inflammatory disease and not known to have had joint disease (median 27 hours after death). The results for interleukin 1β clearly show higher cytokine levels in patients with RA and other arthritides than in patients with osteoarthritis, trauma, or the patients at necropsy. Interferon γ levels in patients with osteoarthritis and the patients at necropsy, however, were significantly greater than in patients with RA, and tumour necrosis factor α levels were also greater in the patients at necropsy compared with patients with RA. This study also correlated histomorphological patterns of synovitis and indicators of local inflammatory activity with synovial fluid cytokine levels, showing, for example, a positive association of interleukin 1β titre and a negative association of interferon γ titre with ulcerogranulomatous synovitis (itself associated with RA). Taken together, these results extend and strengthen data suggesting a possible part played by increased synovial fluid levels of interleukin 1β in joint destruction in RA, but provide no evidence for increases in levels of tumour necrosis factor α or interferon γ affecting the disease pathology.

Several cytokines which function as immunological mediators of inflammation may also cause joint destruction in rheumatoid arthritis (RA). Interleukin 1 stimulates the secretion of prostaglandin E₂, platelet derived growth factor, and collagenase by fibroblasts and chondrocytes, and the proliferation of fibroblasts and their production of fibronectin, type I collagen, and proteoglycans. Tumour necrosis factor α also stimulates fibroblast and chondrocyte production of prostaglandin E₂ and collagenase, bone resorption, and fibroblast proliferation. Various other factors have also been implicated, such as interleukin 6, which stimulates the acute phase production of proteins such as C reactive protein, and enhances antibody production including rheumatoid factors, and interferon γ which stimulates the expression of major histocompatibility complex class II molecules on synovial cells, implicated in triggering autoimmune T cells.

According to several papers, these cytokines are found in the synovial fluid of patients with RA, which supports their part in the immunopathology of RA. Several other cytokines, including the major T cell growth factor interleukin 2, are, however, not found in synovial fluid either by bioassay, immunoassay, or as mRNA. Moreover, whereas there seems to be a consensus on interleukin 1 and interleukin 6, several workers have reported low levels or the absence of interferon γ and tumour necrosis factor α in synovial fluid from patients with RA, and deficient secretion of interferon γ and tumour necrosis factor γ by stimulated peripheral blood mononuclear cells. One problem in interpreting the previous studies on the cytokine content in synovial fluid is the absence of normal control subjects which leaves open the possibility that findings in patients with RA may not necessarily be abnormal. Most studies have compared cytokine levels in patients with RA with those in patients with osteoarthritis or trauma, and conclusions on increased cytokine levels therefore are not necessarily relevant to normal joints. Where synovial fluid from non-arthritic subjects has been examined, levels of tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ higher than in patients with RA have sometimes been reported.

As it is almost impossible to obtain synovial fluid from the joints of normal volunteers, this study determined interleukin 1β, tumour necrosis factor α, and interferon γ in synovial fluid from 14–18 patients at necropsy not known to have had rheumatoid arthritis less than 48 hours after death. These results were then compared with groups of patients with RA, other arthritides, osteoarthritis, and trauma.

Patients and methods

SUBJECTS
Twenty seven patients with RA diagnosed according to the 1987 American Rheumatism Association criteria and attending the Robert-Bosch Hospital, Stuttgart or the University Hospitals, Tübingen were studied. The median age was 59 years (range 35–79), 60% were women, and 75% were positive for rheumatoid factor. Sixteen patients with other arthritides (two with gout, three with calcium pyrophosphate deposition disease, one with salmonella reactive arthritis, one with campylobacter reactive arthritis, one with Lyme disease, one with psoriatic arthritis, and seven unclassified arthritides (median age 41 years, range 20–76, 31% women)) were also studied. Another 23 patients with osteoarthritis (median age 58 years, range 17–79, 48% women), were included. Thirteen had acute traumatic knee injuries (median age 29 years,
Tumour Cytokine Subject
Interferon

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cytokine</th>
<th>Rheumatoid arthritis</th>
<th>Other arthritides</th>
<th>Osteoarthritis</th>
<th>Trauma</th>
<th>Patients at necropsy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interleukin 1β (pg/ml)</td>
<td>193 (57)</td>
<td>211 (125)</td>
<td>21 (13)</td>
<td>&lt;20</td>
<td>&lt;20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interferon γ (U/ml)</td>
<td>0.6 (0.2)</td>
<td>2.4 (4.0)</td>
<td>23.8 (14.0)</td>
<td>4.7 (2.1)</td>
<td>38.8 (13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumour necrosis factor α (ng/ml)</td>
<td>0.17 (0.04)</td>
<td>0.97 (0.05)</td>
<td>0.08 (0.03)</td>
<td>0.62 (0.55)</td>
<td>2.89 (0.89)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Significantly (p<0.05) different from the RA value.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the results of measuring levels of interleukin 1β, tumour necrosis factor α, and interferon γ in the same samples of synovial fluid from donors with rheumatoid arthritis, other arthritides, osteoarthritis, trauma, or from patients at necropsy. There is a clear and significant increase of interleukin 1β in patients with RA and other arthritides compared with the other three groups. Only small amounts of tumour necrosis factor α or interferon γ were found in synovial fluid from patients with RA. The highest levels of tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were found in synovial fluid in patients at necropsy, and these were significantly greater than in patients with RA. For tumour necrosis factor α, only synovial fluid from patients at necropsy contained large amounts of this cytokine, whereas synovial fluid from patients at necropsy and patients with osteoarthritis contained large amounts of interferon γ. Synovial fluid from patients with trauma

IMMUNOASSAYS

Tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were determined by radioimmunoassay kits purchased from Medgenix (Dusseldorf, Germany). Interleukin 1β was measured in an enzyme-linked immunoassay (ELISA) using kits from Cistron Biotechnology (Pine Brook, NJ, USA). The tumour necrosis factor α, interferon γ, and interleukin 1β assays had sensitivities of 10 pg/ml, 1 U/ml, and 20 pg/ml, respectively. The tumour necrosis factor α assay showed no cross-reactivity with tumour necrosis factor β, interleukin 1, interleukin 2 nor interferons; the interferon γ assay did not react with up to 10³ U/ml of interferon β, and the interleukin 1β assay showed no cross-reactivity on interleukin 1α, interleukin 2, tumour necrosis factor α, nor interferon γ (manufacturers’ data). Results obtained using these kits were transferred directly from the measuring device (γ-counter or ELISA reader) to a PC for data analysis using in-house computer programs (Schaudt et al., in preparation).

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Student’s t test was used for parametric analyses, whereas the Mann-Whitney U test was used for non-parametric analysis.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the results of measuring levels of interleukin 1β, tumour necrosis factor α, and interferon γ in the same samples of synovial fluid from donors with rheumatoid arthritis, other arthritides, osteoarthritis, trauma, or from patients at necropsy. There is a clear and significant increase of interleukin 1β in patients with RA and other arthritides compared with the other three groups. Only small amounts of tumour necrosis factor α or interferon γ were found in synovial fluid from patients with RA. The highest levels of tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were found in synovial fluid in patients at necropsy, and these were significantly greater than in patients with RA. For tumour necrosis factor α, only synovial fluid from patients at necropsy contained large amounts of this cytokine, whereas synovial fluid from patients at necropsy and patients with osteoarthritis contained large amounts of interferon γ. Synovial fluid from patients with trauma

IMMUNOASSAYS

Tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were determined by radioimmunoassay kits purchased from Medgenix (Dusseldorf, Germany). Interleukin 1β was measured in an enzyme-linked immunoassay (ELISA) using kits from Cistron Biotechnology (Pine Brook, NJ, USA). The tumour necrosis factor α, interferon γ, and interleukin 1β assays had sensitivities of 10 pg/ml, 1 U/ml, and 20 pg/ml, respectively. The tumour necrosis factor α assay showed no cross-reactivity with tumour necrosis factor β, interleukin 1, interleukin 2 nor interferons; the interferon γ assay did not react with up to 10³ U/ml interferon β, and the interleukin 1β assay showed no cross-reactivity on interleukin 1α, interleukin 2, tumour necrosis factor α, nor interferon γ (manufacturers’ data). Results obtained using these kits were transferred directly from the measuring device (γ-counter or ELISA reader) to a PC for data analysis using in-house computer programs (Schaudt et al., in preparation).

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Student’s t test was used for parametric analyses, whereas the Mann-Whitney U test was used for non-parametric analysis.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the results of measuring levels of interleukin 1β, tumour necrosis factor α, and interferon γ in the same samples of synovial fluid from donors with rheumatoid arthritis, other arthritides, osteoarthritis, trauma, or from patients at necropsy. There is a clear and significant increase of interleukin 1β in patients with RA and other arthritides compared with the other three groups. Only small amounts of tumour necrosis factor α or interferon γ were found in synovial fluid from patients with RA. The highest levels of tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were found in synovial fluid in patients at necropsy, and these were significantly greater than in patients with RA. For tumour necrosis factor α, only synovial fluid from patients at necropsy contained large amounts of this cytokine, whereas synovial fluid from patients at necropsy and patients with osteoarthritis contained large amounts of interferon γ. Synovial fluid from patients with trauma

IMMUNOASSAYS

Tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were determined by radioimmunoassay kits purchased from Medgenix (Dusseldorf, Germany). Interleukin 1β was measured in an enzyme-linked immunoassay (ELISA) using kits from Cistron Biotechnology (Pine Brook, NJ, USA). The tumour necrosis factor α, interferon γ, and interleukin 1β assays had sensitivities of 10 pg/ml, 1 U/ml, and 20 pg/ml, respectively. The tumour necrosis factor α assay showed no cross-reactivity with tumour necrosis factor β, interleukin 1, interleukin 2 nor interferons; the interferon γ assay did not react with up to 10³ U/ml interferon β, and the interleukin 1β assay showed no cross-reactivity on interleukin 1α, interleukin 2, tumour necrosis factor α, nor interferon γ (manufacturers’ data). Results obtained using these kits were transferred directly from the measuring device (γ-counter or ELISA reader) to a PC for data analysis using in-house computer programs (Schaudt et al., in preparation).

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Student’s t test was used for parametric analyses, whereas the Mann-Whitney U test was used for non-parametric analysis.

RESULTS

Table 1 shows the results of measuring levels of interleukin 1β, tumour necrosis factor α, and interferon γ in the same samples of synovial fluid from donors with rheumatoid arthritis, other arthritides, osteoarthritis, trauma, or from patients at necropsy. There is a clear and significant increase of interleukin 1β in patients with RA and other arthritides compared with the other three groups. Only small amounts of tumour necrosis factor α or interferon γ were found in synovial fluid from patients with RA. The highest levels of tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were found in synovial fluid in patients at necropsy, and these were significantly greater than in patients with RA. For tumour necrosis factor α, only synovial fluid from patients at necropsy contained large amounts of this cytokine, whereas synovial fluid from patients at necropsy and patients with osteoarthritis contained large amounts of interferon γ. Synovial fluid from patients with trauma

IMMUNOASSAYS

Tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ were determined by radioimmunoassay kits purchased from Medgenix (Dusseldorf, Germany). Interleukin 1β was measured in an enzyme-linked immunoassay (ELISA) using kits from Cistron Biotechnology (Pine Brook, NJ, USA). The tumour necrosis factor α, interferon γ, and interleukin 1β assays had sensitivities of 10 pg/ml, 1 U/ml, and 20 pg/ml, respectively. The tumour necrosis factor α assay showed no cross-reactivity with tumour necrosis factor β, interleukin 1, interleukin 2 nor interferons; the interferon γ assay did not react with up to 10³ U/ml interferon β, and the interleukin 1β assay showed no cross-reactivity on interleukin 1α, interleukin 2, tumour necrosis factor α, nor interferon γ (manufacturers’ data). Results obtained using these kits were transferred directly from the measuring device (γ-counter or ELISA reader) to a PC for data analysis using in-house computer programs (Schaudt et al., in preparation).

STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Student’s t test was used for parametric analyses, whereas the Mann-Whitney U test was used for non-parametric analysis.
Cytokines in synovial fluid

Table 2 Correlation between mean synovial fluid cytokine levels and the histomorphological pattern of synovitis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cytokine</th>
<th>Histomorphological subtype of synovitis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>sf [(n=18)]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interleukin 1β (pg/ml)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interferon γ (U/ml)</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tumour necrosis factor α (ng/ml)</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*sf* serofibrous; *bp* lymphoplasmacellular; *ug* ulcerogranulomatous; *tt* transformed appearing cell synovitis.

†Significantly increased or decreased (p<0.05) compared to the sf group.

Table 3 Correlation between synovial fluid cytokine levels and parameters of local inflammation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Histological grade†</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acute inflammation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of patients</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean interleukin 1β (pg/ml)</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean interferon γ (U/ml)</td>
<td>8.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean tumour necrosis factor α (ng/ml)</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronic inflammation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of patients</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean interleukin 1β (pg/ml)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean interferon γ (U/ml)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean tumour necrosis factor α (ng/ml)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fibrotic inflammation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of patients</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean interleukin 1β (pg/ml)</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean interferon γ (U/ml)</td>
<td>0.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean tumour necrosis factor α (ng/ml)</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* (Grade 1), none detected; (grade 2) just detectable; (grade 3) unequivocal; (grade 4) obvious.
†Significantly (p<0.05) different from grade 1 (or grade 2 for chronic inflammation).

Table 2 shows that the interleukin 1β titre was significantly positively associated with the ulcerogranulomatous pattern of synovitis (ulcerous synovitis) compared with the serofibrous synovitis pattern (not associated with RA). Furthermore, there is also an association between the presence of transformed appearing cells in the synovial membrane and the interleukin 1β titre. In contrast, interferon γ showed a negative association with ulcerous synovitis and a significant positive association with low activity serofibrous synovitis. Although the tumour necrosis factor α titre was low, it was also significantly increased in ulcerous compared with serofibrous synovitis.

Of further interest were the significant positive associations between histologically defined grades of acute and chronic inflammatory activity in synovial tissue biopsy samples and the amount of synovial fluid interleukin 1β (table 3). There was also a (non-significant) trend towards the same association between synovial fluid interleukin 1β content and grade of histological fibrosis assigned to the tissue (table 3). In contrast to interleukin 1β, interferon γ correlated negatively with acute and chronic inflammation. Only the former correlation reached statistical significance, however. Tumour necrosis factor α did not show any significant associations with acute, chronic or fibrotic inflammation.

Discussion

The data presented here are consistent with the consensus that levels of interleukin 1β are increased in the synovial fluid of patients with RA as well as in their serum. It is further implied that interleukin 1β titres are associated with joint pathology by the novel finding of a significant quantitative correlation between levels of interleukin 1β in synovial fluid and certain histomorphological patterns of synovitis (table 2). Thus, for example, in independent analyses, ulcerogranulomatous synovitis was found to be significantly positively associated with RA, and is here shown to be positively associated with the interleukin 1β titre. Grades of acute or chronic inflammation, as well as fibrotic status in synovial biopsy samples, have also been correlated with cytokine titres (table 3). These data are consistent with a report that the level of interleukin 1β in serum samples correlates with clinical disease activity, but this had not previously been shown directly in the joint. In agreement with the supposition that synovial fluid from normal joints contains less or no interleukin 1β, data presented here show that not only do synovial fluid samples from patients with trauma and osteoarthritis contain little interleukin 1β, but that synovial fluid from patients at necropsy has none. So far, there has been little possibility of measuring cytokine levels in normal joints, and our results with patients at necropsy reflect an attempt to find a group of control subjects without rheumatistic disease. Where ‘normal’ joints have been examined previously, little interleukin 1β has been found.

In contrast to results for interleukin 1β, reports on the presence of interferon γ and tumour necrosis factor α in synovial fluid from patients with rheumatoid arthritis have been contradictory. This may in part be due to the different immunoassays or even bioassays used to determine the cytokines. Several workers found little or no tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ in synovial fluid from patients with rheumatoid arthritis, others did succeed in showing their presence, albeit sometimes only in a fraction of patients with RA. For example, in one study of 59 patients with RA, very high levels of tumour necrosis factor α were found in only one synovial fluid sample, high levels in two, detectable levels in a further 16, and none in the remaining 40 either by bioassay or immunoassay. In the studies where these two cytokines were found, it was difficult to judge whether their presence was pathological because normal controls were not included. Some workers have found large amounts of these cytokines in ‘normal’ control subjects and low levels or none in patients with RA, a result in agreement with the present data on synovial fluid from patients at necropsy and patients with RA. Other workers have found tumour necrosis factor α in synovial fluid from patients with RA but only low levels in ‘normal’ synovial fluid (actually from patients with trauma). Compared with the results on synovial fluid from patients at necropsy we also found low levels of tumour necrosis factor α in synovial fluid from patients with trauma, so these results may not be discrepant as seems at first sight.

The presence of relatively low levels of tumour necrosis factor α and interferon γ in most synovial fluid samples from patients with...
RA may also be consistent with several reports of defects in the ability of RA lymphocytes to secrete these cytokines after stimulation in vitro, although even this is not always observed. Tumour necrosis factor is generally present in serum samples from normal donors, but tumour necrosis factor was shown in serum samples from patients with RA. Tumour necrosis factor is generally increased, and tumour necrosis factor, and may also have been affected by other factors. Unlike interferon, however, tumour necrosis factor is secreted by synovial tissue itself, so secretion by peripheral blood mononuclear cells may not reflect synovial fluid levels.

Thus, taken together with the present results, a consensus from published work allows the conclusion that in synovial fluid from patients with RA, interleukin is generally increased, interferon is generally decreased, and tumour necrosis factor is equivocal, with a few patients having increased tumour necrosis factor but most decreased tumour necrosis factor. This may reflect heterogeneity in the RA processes or disease stage, as well as different techniques for the measurement of tumour necrosis factor. In the synovial fluid of 27 patients with rheumatoid arthritis with a mean of 0.17 ng/ml tumour necrosis factor (table 1), only one patient clearly had a high level (0.98 ng/ml; data not shown), similar to the results of Duff et al, where at most only three of 59 patients had high levels of tumour necrosis factor in their synovial fluid, and of Westacott et al., where only two of 54 patients with RA had synovial fluid with >1 ng/ml of tumour necrosis factor. In the light of these results, it could even be questioned whether RA could be viewed as associated with a deficiency in the production of the inflammatory cytokines tumour necrosis factor and interferon, rather than a deregulated pathological increase. This would be consistent with the fact that several drugs used to treat RA are known to potentiate aspects of immune responsiveness by blocking prostaglandin E₂ production or by enhancing cytokine secretion. Tumour necrosis factor and interferon are generally thought of as substances involved in the upregulation of the immune response, but they may also participate in negative regulatory control, by direct growth inhibitory effects, or by immunoregulation. Thus, for example, tumour necrosis factor (but not interferon) has been shown to inhibit selectively clonal expansion of a subset of helper T cells. Cytokine networks within the rheumatoid joint are, however, clearly more complex than understood at present and other identified factors such as interleukin are likely to play a part in the pathological process. Therefore, much needs to be established before substitution treatments designed to correct cytokine defects acquire a convincing rationale. Nonetheless, a preliminary report on the treatment of RA with interferon has illustrated the potential value of this approach.

This work was supported in part by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (SFB 120) and by the Robert Bosch Foundation. The assistance of Ms A Rehbinder and Ms S Koch is gratefully acknowledged. This work forms part of the MD thesis of P Kahle.

Determination of cytokines in synovial fluids: correlation with diagnosis and histomorphological characteristics of synovial tissue.

P Kahle, J G Saal, K Schaudt, J Zacher, P Fritz and G Pawelec

doi: 10.1136/ard.51.6.731

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://ard.bmj.com/content/51/6/731

These include:

**Email alerting service**
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

---

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/